

CONTRIBUTIONS TO INTERNATIONAL ADVERTISING RESEARCH

An Assessment of the Literature Between 1990 and 2002

Shaoming Zou

ABSTRACT: Research in the field of international advertising has produced a large volume of literature. Although some attempts have been made in the past to review this stream of research, there has been no attempt to assess the contributions to this literature by individuals and institutions. This study assesses the contributions of individual researchers and institutions from 1990 to 2002, based on their publications in major advertising, marketing, and international business journals, and the Social Science Citation Index (SSCI). The findings of this study offer researchers a unique view of this field and some directions for future research.

As a field of academic inquiry, international advertising has attracted numerous researchers during the last four decades. In the early 1960s, for example, Roostal (1963) published a seminal work focusing on the standardization of international advertising in Western Europe. Later, Buzzell (1968) advanced a broad framework of international standardization and adaptation of advertising as well as the general marketing program. Since then, there has been a steady stream of research focusing on international advertising topics. As a consequence, international advertising has clearly become a legitimate field of academic inquiry.

In the past, there have been several attempts to review and synthesize the international advertising literature, and/or to offer suggestions for other researchers (e.g., Agrawal 1995; Onkvisit and Shaw 1999; Taylor 2002; Zinkhan 1994). Focusing on the substantive and empirical issues of international advertising research, these efforts significantly consolidated the knowledge of international advertising and pointed out a number of very important research directions for international advertising researchers. Yet there has been no attempt to assess the contributions of individual researchers and institutions to this field of inquiry, nor has there been any attempt to assess the impact of various publications in this field. Researchers and readers of this literature are left wondering what has been researched recently, which outlets are most appropriate for publishing international advertising research, who the major contributors are, and which articles have had the greatest impact on the field in recent years. Given that inter-

national advertising is a well-established field, it is important to address these unanswered questions because such knowledge could give researchers a more complete view of their field, a clear idea about their impact on the literature, a guide in selecting their research topics and target journals, and motivation to continue making contributions to this field.

The purpose of this study is threefold. First, the primary issues of recent international advertising research and the major outlets for international advertising research are investigated. Specifically, the major advertising, marketing, and international business journals are ranked by the number of articles that they have published on international advertising topics; the frequency of publications focusing on various topics is also reported. Second, the productivity of individual researchers and institutions in international advertising research between 1990 and 2002 is assessed. This is done by tabulating the credited publications of individual researchers and institutions in major advertising, marketing, and international business journals. Third, the impact of individual publications and individual researchers on the international advertising literature is assessed based on a citation analysis using the Social Science Citation Index (SSCI). In the remainder of this paper, the methodology adopted for this investigation will be described. This will be followed by a presentation of the results of the assessment. The paper will conclude with a discussion of the outcomes of the investigation.

METHOD

Scope of the Study

This study focuses on international advertising articles published in major advertising, marketing, and international

Shaoming Zou (Ph.D., Michigan State University) is an associate professor of marketing in the Department of Marketing, College of Business, University of Missouri–Columbia. The author thanks Jason Garrett of the University of Missouri–Columbia for his assistance in this research.

business journals from 1990 to 2002. While international advertising research has been around for over four decades, and many early contributions have had a major impact on the literature, the current interest is in assessing recent contributions to the international advertising literature. This is because contributions between 1990 and 2002 reflect the changes in the modern international advertising environment more closely, including but not limited to the rapid globalization of the world markets and firms' substantially increased cross-border business. It is important to keep in mind that the current study's focus on recent publications by no means implies a lack of impact of publications appearing before 1990. Rather, focusing on the contributions between 1990 and 2002 should render the results of this study more relevant to current international advertising researchers.

The rationale for a focus on the major journals of advertising, marketing, and international business is that publications in such journals are most likely to have the largest exposure to international advertising researchers and reflect state-of-the-art international advertising research that generates a significant number of citations in the literature. The major advertising journals included in the present study are the *Journal of Advertising* (JA), the *Journal of Advertising Research* (JAR), and the *Journal of Current Issues and Research in Advertising* (JCIRA), which are commonly deemed the top three academic journals in advertising (Henthorne, LaTour, and Loraas 1998). The major journals in marketing included the *Journal of Marketing* (JM), the *Journal of Marketing Research* (JMR), and the *Journal of Consumer Research* (JCR), which are widely viewed as the top three academic journals in marketing. The major journals in international business were selected based on Dubois and Reeb's (2000) ranking of international business journals. Dubois and Reeb (2000) used both a citation analysis and an opinion survey to rank 30 journals that focus on publishing international business research. For the current study, those marketing-related journals rated among the top 10 international business journals based on Dubois and Reeb's (2000) impact ranking were selected. Specifically, these included the *Journal of International Business Studies* (JIBS), *International Marketing Review* (IMR), the *Journal of International Marketing* (JIM), *Advances in International Marketing* (AIM), and the *Journal of Global Marketing* (JGM). In total, the current study focuses on 11 academic journals.

Selection of Articles

The international advertising articles were selected through a combination of electronic and manual searches. The ABI/INFORM database was used to identify a pool of articles that might be relevant to international advertising. Key words such as "international advertising," "cross-cultural advertising," "cross-national advertising," "global advertising," "compara-

tive advertising," "international AND advertising," and "culture AND advertising" were used to electronically identify articles published in the 11 aforementioned journals. In addition, the titles of all articles published in the 11 journals from 1990 to 2002 were manually searched to identify articles that might be related to international advertising research. Overall, 180 articles were identified from both searches.

Each article was then manually examined to ascertain that it was indeed an international advertising research article, and should therefore be included in the study. Several criteria were followed during this stage. First, because the purpose of this study is to assess the contributions to international advertising research, only research articles and pieces that contained a substantial proportion of academic content were retained. Thus, most editorials written by journal editors, comments on a previously published article, and case studies were excluded. Second, since the current interest is in international advertising, many articles that investigated advertising in a single country (e.g., use of humor in television advertising in Poland) were also excluded. Indeed, if such single-country studies were included, studies on advertising issues in the United States would have to be included as international advertising articles as well, since they would appear to be international to foreign readers. Third, some studies that investigated advertising in a given country and then compared the findings to those in another country without collecting data in the comparison country were also excluded. This is because such studies were essentially "noninternational" in nature. Nevertheless, conceptual articles and review pieces on international advertising were retained for further assessment.

At the end of the process, 122 articles were retained for the assessment. Of these, a vast majority of articles are empirical in nature. Only about a dozen articles are conceptual or review pieces. Furthermore, the retained articles adopted a wide variety of approaches to collecting and analyzing data, including content analysis, survey, experiment, *t* test, ANOVA (analysis of variance), regression, χ^2 test, and simple descriptive statistics. In addition, the subjects investigated also varied across the articles.

Total Contributions and Credited Contributions

To assess the productivity of individual researchers in international advertising research, both the total appearances of an author and the well-established "adjusted (credited) author and institution appearances" methods were adopted. These methods have been used in assessing the author and institutional contributions to advertising research (e.g., Henthorne, LaTour, and Loraas 1998), international business research (e.g., Inkpen and Beamish 1994), finance research (e.g., Heck and Cooley 1988), and marketing research. Specifically, the total number of articles within the 122 identified articles in this

study that an author published as a single author or as a coauthor constitutes the total contributions of the author. As for credited contributions, if a published article has a single author, the author is credited for one (1) publication. If an article has two authors, each author is credited with half (.5) a publication. If an article has three authors, each author is credited for one-third (.333) of a publication. The same formula applies to articles with four or more authors. An author's total credited contributions are the sum of his or her credited publications for all articles that he or she authored or coauthored in the pool of the 122 identified international advertising articles.

To assess the contributions of institutions to international advertising research, however, only credited contributions were used. In contrast to individual authors whose names would never appear more than once on a published article, institutions' names could appear more than once on the same published article if two or more of their faculty members coauthored the article. As a result, the total appearances method should not be used for assessing the contributions of institutions to avoid double- (or triple-) counting the institutions for the same articles. Thus, institutions whose faculty members authored or coauthored an article are credited for the same portion of publication that their faculty members are credited for. For example, if a faculty member of an institution coauthored one of the 122 articles with two other authors from other institutions, the institution is credited for one-third (.333) of the publication. If two faculty members of the same institution coauthored an article, the institution is credited for one publication (.5 + .5). The same method applies in a similar way to articles coauthored by any other combination of coauthors. An institution's total credited contributions are the sum of its credited publications for all articles that its faculty members authored or coauthored in the 122-article pool that is the focus of this study.

Citation Analysis

Citations in a journal article are a measure of the extent to which the author(s) of the article considered the cited works useful to their own research and to the development of their own field of knowledge (Chandy and Williams 1994). Thus, the number of citations that a published journal article has received (that is, the number of other publications that cited the article) is a good measure of the impact that the article has had on the literature. Indeed, citation counts are widely accepted as a superior ranking criterion in comparison with individual opinions regarding the impact of an article on the social science literature. It is noteworthy, however, that citation analysis is sometimes subject to criticisms such as negative citations, self-citations, and bias that favors methodological articles. Moreover, the number of citations that an article has received

does not reveal the underlying reason for the citation, nor does it show the topical areas on which the citing articles are focused. Nevertheless, the citation count of an article is a reflection of the interest that other social science researchers have had in the cited article (Inkpen and Beamish 1994).

The SSCI is widely accepted around the world as the most authoritative measure of the impact of an article on the related literature. It has been frequently used in articles published in major business journals such as the *Journal of Consumer Research* (e.g., Core, Leong, and Cote 1991), the *Journal of Finance* (e.g., Zivney and Bertin 1992), and *American Economic Review* (e.g., Davis and Papanek 1984) to assess the impact of articles on the marketing, finance, and economics literature. An article that has a significantly higher SSCI count than another article is believed to have had a more significant impact on the related literature (Inkpen and Beamish 1994).

To assess the impact of an individual author on international advertising research, however, the SSCI citations of all articles in the 122-article pool that he or she had authored or coauthored were summed up into the total SSCI citations for the author. The total SSCI citation score for an author is a measure of his or her cumulative impact on the international advertising literature. For example, if an author has published three articles in the 122-article pool, the total SSCI citation count for the author is the sum of the SSCI citations of the three articles. Thus, an article's SSCI citations measure the article's impact, whereas an author's total SSCI citations measure the author's impact on the international advertising literature.

In the current study, the ISI's Web-based SSCI database was used to assess the impact of each international advertising article and its author(s). The ISI database contains SSCI counts for the nine-year period from the beginning of 1995 to the end of 2003. Thus, for each article in the 122-article pool, its SSCI citations were obtained from the ISI Web of Science database. A researcher's *total SSCI citations* were computed as the sum of the SSCI citations of all the articles in the 122-article pool that the researcher authored or coauthored.

RESULTS

Frequency of International Advertising Research in Journals

Table 1 presents the total number of international advertising research articles published in each of the 11 journals targeted in this study between 1990 and 2002. As is shown, the *Journal of Advertising Research* (JAR) tops the pack with publication of 31 international advertising research articles, followed by the *Journal of Advertising* (JA) with 28 articles, *International Marketing Review* (IMR) with 20 articles, and *Advances in International Marketing* (AIM) with 18 articles. JA and JAR appear to be the most popular outlets for interna-

TABLE 1
**Number of International Advertising Articles Published in Major Advertising,
 Marketing, and International Business Journals (1990–2002)**

Journal	Number of articles	Percentage of total
<i>Journal of Advertising Research</i>	31	25.41%
<i>Journal of Advertising</i>	28	22.95%
<i>International Marketing Review</i>	20	16.39%
<i>Advances in International Marketing</i>	18	14.75%
<i>Journal of International Marketing</i>	7	5.74%
<i>Journal of Global Marketing</i>	6	4.92%
<i>Journal of Consumer Research</i>	4	3.28%
<i>Journal of Current Issues and Research in Advertising</i>	4	3.28%
<i>Journal of Marketing</i>	2	1.64%
<i>Journal of International Business Studies</i>	2	1.64%
<i>Journal of Marketing Research</i>	0	0.00%

tional advertising research. In contrast to these four journals, other journals published far fewer international advertising research articles. In particular, the *Journal of Marketing Research* (JMR) did not publish any international advertising research in the 1990–2002 period, and the *Journal of International Business Studies* published only two.

Frequency of International Advertising Research by Topics

The 122 articles in the pool were content-analyzed to uncover the major topical areas of international advertising research. First, the primary and/or secondary topics of each article were identified and tabulated. Second, these topics were then grouped into seven broad topical areas. These included (1) standardization of international advertising, (2) consumer response to international advertising, (3) content of international advertising, (4) social issues, (5) cultural values, (6) campaign management, and (7) international advertising agency. Third, each article was classified into one of the seven topical areas based on its primary topic. It should be recognized that some articles investigated multiple topics. Because this classification system does not allow an article to be classified into more than one topical area, it does not reflect the topical variations within an article. Rather, it is meant to capture the primary topics investigated in the 122 articles.

While standardization/adaptation articles are familiar to many researchers in this field, other topical areas need to be defined for this study. Articles with primary topics in the consumer response area deal with ways that consumers react to international advertisements, whereas articles about the content of international advertising consider the elements within advertisements. Articles in the social issues area investigate topics such as complex regulatory environments, issues of race, and issues of sex in international advertisements. Cultural values articles investigate how unique cultural val-

ues impact the creation and design of international advertisements, while campaign management articles deal with the unique issues concerning the administration of international advertising campaigns. Agency articles primarily deal with the impacts and specific issues that surround using advertising agencies or the client–agency relationship in an international context. Table 2 contains the frequency of the seven topical areas researched in the 122 included articles.

As shown in Table 2, the top two most researched topics in recent international advertising studies are standardization of and consumer response to international advertising. The content of international advertising, social issues, and cultural values are the next three most frequently researched topical areas. Campaign management and agency issues are primarily researched in nine and four articles, respectively.

Top Individual Contributors to International Advertising Research

Table 3 shows the top individual contributors to international advertising research based on the total contributions between 1990 and 2002. As can be seen, Charles R. Taylor, Gordon E. Miracle, and Barbara Mueller are the top three contributors to the international advertising research realm, each with four or more publications in the 1990–2002 period. Dana J. Alden, J. Craig Andrews, Srinivas Durvasula, John S. Hill, Michael Jay Polonsky, Jyotika Ramaprasad, and Alan T. Shao round out the top-10 individual contributors category, each with three publications. There are 31 authors who contributed two publications on international advertising in the 1990–2002 period.

Table 4 presents the list of top individual contributors to international advertising research based on their total credited contributions. As can be seen, Charles R. Taylor and Barbara Mueller are the top two contributors to this field based on total credited contributions, followed by Carolyn

TABLE 2
Frequency of International Advertising Articles by Topical Areas (1990–2002)

Topical areas	Number of articles	Frequency
Standardization	34	27.87%
Consumer response	26	21.31%
Advertising content	18	14.75%
Social issues	17	13.93%
Cultural values	14	11.48%
Campaign management	9	7.38%
Agency	4	3.28%

TABLE 3
Top Contributors to International Advertising Research Based on Total Number of Publications in Major Advertising, Marketing, and International Business Journals (1990–2002)

Author	Total number of publications	Rank
Charles R. Taylor	9	1
Gordon E. Miracle	5	2
Barbara Mueller	4	3
Dana L. Alden	3	4
J. Craig Andrews	3	4
Srinivas Durvasula	3	4
John S. Hill	3	4
Michael Jay Polonsky	3	4
Jyotika Ramaprasad	3	4
Alan T. Shao	3	4
Jennifer L. Aaker	2	11
Nancy D. Albers-Miller	2	11
Les Carlson	2	11
Joelle Catalano	2	11
Cypress Chang	2	11
Bob D. Cutler	2	11
Patrick De Pelsmacker	2	11
Teresa J. Domzal	2	11
John B. Ford	2	11
Betsy D. Gelb	2	11
James W. Gentry	2	11
Maggie Geuens	2	11
Earl D. Honeycutt, Jr.	2	11
Ali Kanso	2	11
Bruce D. Keillor	2	11
Jerome B. Kernan	2	11
Durriya H. Z. Khairullah	2	11
Zahid Y. Khairullah	2	11
Carolyn A. Lin	2	11
Steven Lysonski	2	11
Lynda M. Maddox	2	11
Sak Onkvisit	2	11
Mary Anne Raymond	2	11
Martin S. Roth	2	11
John J. Shaw	2	11
Susan Tai	2	11
Chow-Hou Wee	2	11
Jeryl Whitelock	2	11
R. Dale Wilson	2	11
George Zinkhan	2	11
Fred Zandpour	2	11

TABLE 4
Top Contributors to International Advertising Research Based on Total Credited Publications in Major Advertising, Marketing, and International Business Journals (1990–2002)

Author	Credited number of publications	Rank
Charles R. Taylor	4.33	1
Barbara Mueller	3.5	2
Carolyn A. Lin	2	3
Gordon E. Miracle	2	3
Martin S. Roth	2	3
Alan T. Shao	2	3
Nancy D. Albers-Miller	1.5	7
John S. Hill	1.5	7
Ali Kanso	1.5	7
Jyotika Ramaprasad	1.5	7
George Zinkhan	1.333	11
Susan Tai	1.333	11
Dana L. Alden	1.167	13
Michael Jay Polonsky	1.167	13

Note: Twenty-seven other researchers had one credited publication.

A. Lin, Gordon E. Miracle, Martin S. Roth, and Alan T. Shao. From Tables 3 and 4, it appears that there is a group of researchers who have been active in international advertising research and have frequently published international advertising articles in major advertising, marketing, and international business journals.

Top Institutional Contributors to International Advertising Research

Table 5 shows the top institutional contributors to international advertising research based on their total credited contributions. Villanova University, Michigan State University, and Cleveland State University are the top three institutional contributors, with four or more total credited contributions. San Diego State University, the National University of Singapore, and the University of Alabama have at least three (3) but lower than four (4) total credited contributions, while Marquette University, the University of Houston, and Old Dominion University have more than two (2) but fewer than three (3) total credited contributions.

It is worth noting that three universities in Europe, one in Southeast Asia, and one in Australia are among the top institutional contributors to international advertising research. Although these institutions outside the United States have made significant contributions to this field, it appears that U.S. institutions are the most frequent contributors to international advertising research in the current study's targeted journals. It is also interesting to note the conspicuous absence of some elite research schools among the top ranked institutional contributors based on total credited contributions.

Most Cited International Advertising Research Articles

The 122 international advertising research articles were ranked based on the total SSCI citations. Table 6 lists the most cited international advertising articles that were published between 1990 and 2002, the journals in which they were published, their titles, and their total SSCI citations. The most cited international advertising research article is Durvasula, Andrews, and Lysonski (1993). Rounding out the top five are Aaker and Williams (1998); Tansey, Hyman, and Zinkhan (1990); Zhang and Gelb (1996); and Aaker and Maheswaran (1997). From Table 6, it is apparent that the most cited international advertising research articles were published in major advertising and marketing journals such as the *Journal of Advertising* (JA), the *Journal of Advertising Research* (JAR), the *Journal of Consumer Research* (JCR), and the *Journal of Marketing* (JM). These are the leading journals that published high-impact international advertising articles from 1990 to 2002. Also noteworthy is that although the number of SSCI citations that the top-ranked international advertising articles received is impressive, most citation counts are relatively modest. Other than the top-10 most cited articles, the articles listed in Table 6 received 20 or less SSCI citations. Though not reported here, 38 articles generated no SSCI citation at all, suggesting their lack of significant impact on the literature.

Because cumulative SSCI tends to favor articles that were published in earlier years (as they have more years to receive SSCI citations), it may not be the best indicator of an article's impact on the literature. To get a better gauge of the relative impact of an article, the SSCI citations of an article need to be adjusted for the number of years that the article has had to

TABLE 5
Top Institutional Contributors to International Advertising Research (1990–2002)

Institution	Credited number of publications	Rank
Villanova University	5.667	1
Michigan State University	4.833	2
Cleveland State University	4	3
San Diego State University	3.5	4
National University of Singapore	3	5
University of Alabama	3	5
Marquette University, Milwaukee	2.667	7
University of Houston	2.333	8
Old Dominion University	2.167	9
Boston College	2	10
Central Michigan University	2	10
Clemson University	2	10
George Mason University	2	10
Kansas State University	2	10
Southern Illinois University–Carbondale	2	10
University of Hawaii at Manoa	2	10
University of North Carolina–Charlotte	2	10
Georgia State University	2	10
University of North Texas	1.833	19
Southwest Missouri State University	1.667	20
University of Antwerp, Belgium	1.667	20
California State University–Fullerton	1.619	22
George Washington University	1.5	23
Oregon State University	1.5	23
City University of New York	1.5	23
Louisiana State University	1.5	23
University of Oklahoma	1.333	27
University of Newcastle	1.167	28
University of Muenster, Germany	1	29
University of Nijmegen, Netherlands	1	29

Note: Twelve other institutions were credited for one publication.

receive SSCI citations during the 1995–2003 period. Table 7 shows the ranking of the most cited international advertising articles based on SSCI citations per year. Based on this table, the top four high-impact articles are Aaker and Williams (1998); Alden, Steenkamp, and Batra (1999); Aaker and Maheswaran (1997); and Zhang and Gelb (1996).

Most Cited International Advertising Researchers

To identify the most cited international advertising researchers, the total SSCI citations were used. Table 8 shows the most cited international advertising researchers who had published at least two international advertising articles between 1990 and 2002, based on their total SSCI citations. As can be seen, Jennifer L. Aaker is the top cited international advertising researcher, followed by Dana L. Alden, George Zinkhan, J. Craig Andrews, Srinivas Durvasula, Betsy D. Gelb, Barbara Mueller, Charles R. Taylor, Cypress Chang, and Fred Zandpour as the top-10 most cited international advertising research-

ers. Not surprisingly, most of these authors are also ranked among the top individual contributors to international advertising research. Clearly, for the period of 1990 to 2002, they are among the top scholars in international advertising, and represent the core intellectual pool of the field.

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

This study represents the first attempt to assess the contributions to international advertising research by individual contributors and institutional contributors in the period from 1990 to 2002. It also assesses the impact of individual articles and individual authors on the international advertising literature based on an SSCI citation analysis. The implications of the study are discussed below with the hope of offering some concluding remarks about the international advertising literature.

First, international advertising research has attracted a large number of researchers from around the world during the 13

TABLE 6
Most Cited International Advertising Articles by Cumulative SSCI Citations (1990–2002)

Article	Journal	Article title	SSCI	Rank
Durvasula, Andrews, and Lysonski (1993)	JCR	"Assessing the Cross-National Applicability of Consumer Behavior Models: A Model of Attitude Toward Advertising in General"	35	1
Aaker and Williams (1998)	JCR	"Empathy Versus Pride: The Influence of Emotional Appeals Across Cultures"	30	2
Tansey, Hyman, and Zinkhan (1990)	JA	"Cultural Themes in Brazilian and U.S. Auto Ads: A Cross-Cultural Comparison"	29	3
Zhang and Gelb (1996)	JA	"Matching Advertising Appeals to Culture: The Influence of Products' Use Conditions"	29	3
Aaker and Maheswaran (1997)	JCR	"The Effect of Cultural Orientation on Persuasion"	29	3
Alden, Hoyer, and Lee (1993)	JM	"Identifying Global and Culture-Specific Dimensions of Humor"	27	6
Cheng and Schweitzer (1996)	JAR	"Cultural Values Reflected in Chinese and U.S. TV Commercials"	25	7
Alden, Steenkamp, and Batra (1999)	JM	"Brand Positioning Through Advertising in Asia, North America, and Europe: The Role of Global Consumer Culture"	22	8
Zandpour, Chang, and Catalano (1992)	JAR	"Stories, Symbols, and Straight Talk: A Comparative Analysis of French, Taiwanese, and U.S. TV Commercials"	21	9
Koslow, Shamdasani, and Touchstone (1994)	JCR	"Exploring Language Effects in Ethnic Advertising: A Sociolinguistic Perspective"	21	9
Mueller (1992)	JAR	"Standardization Vs. Specialization: An Examination of Westernization in Japanese Advertising"	20	11
Zinkhan (1994)	JA	"International Advertising: A Research Agenda"	19	12
Biswas, Olsen, and Carlet (1992)	JA	"A Comparison of Print Advertisements from the U.S. and France"	16	13
Albers-Miller and Gelb (1996)	JA	"Business Advertising Appeals as a Mirror of Cultural Dimensions: A Study of Eleven Countries"	15	14
Kanso (1992)	JAR	"International Advertising Strategies: Global Commitment to Local Vision"	15	14
Lin (1993)	JAR	"Cultural Differences in Message Strategies: A Comparison Between American and Japanese TV Commercials"	15	14
Roth (1995)	JA	"Effects of Global Market Conditions on Brand Image Customization and Brand Performance"	14	17
James and Hill (1991)	JAR	"International Advertising Messages: To Adapt or Not to Adapt (That Is the Question)"	13	18
Taylor, Miracle, and Wilson (1997)	JA	"The Impact of Information Level on the Effectiveness of U.S. and Korean TV Commercials"	12	19
Roth (1992)	JA	"Depth Vs. Breadth Strategies for Global Brand Image Management"	12	19
Ramaprasad and Hasegawa (1992)	JAR	"Creative Strategies in American and Japanese TV Commercials: A Comparison"	12	19
Caillat and Mueller (1996)	JAR	"The Influence of Culture on American and British Advertising: An Exploratory Comparison of Beer Advertising"	12	19

Notes: SSCI = Social Science Citation Index; JCR = *Journal of Consumer Research*; JA = *Journal of Advertising*; JM = *Journal of Marketing*; JAR = *Journal of Advertising Research*.

TABLE 7
Most Cited International Advertising Articles by SSCI Citations Per Year (1990–2002)

Article	Journal	Article title	SSCI/Year	Rank
Aaker and Williams (1998)	JCR	"Empathy Versus Pride: The Influence of Emotional Appeals Across Cultures"	6	1
Alden, Steenkamp, and Batra (1999)	JM	"Brand Positioning Through Advertising in Asia, North America, and Europe: The Role of Global Consumer Culture"	5.5	2
Aaker and Maheswaran (1997)	JCR	"The Effect of Cultural Orientation on Persuasion"	4.83	3
Zhang and Gelb (1996)	JA	"Matching Advertising Appeals to Culture: The Influence of Products' Use Conditions"	4.14	4
Durvasula, Andrews, and Lysonski (1993)	JCR	"Assessing the Cross-National Applicability of Consumer Behavior Models: A Model of Attitude Toward Advertising in General"	3.89	5
Cheng and Schweitzer (1996)	JAR	"Cultural Values Reflected in Chinese and U.S. TV Commercials"	3.57	6
Tansey, Hyman, and Zinkhan (1990)	JA	"Cultural Themes in Brazilian and U.S. Auto Ads: A Cross-Cultural Comparison"	3.22	7
Alden, Hoyer, and Lee (1993)	JM	"Identifying Global and Culture-Specific Dimensions of Humor"	3	8
Zandpour, Chang, and Catalano (1992)	JAR	"Stories, Symbols, and Straight Talk: A Comparative Analysis of French, Taiwanese, and U.S. TV Commercials"	2.33	9
Koslow, Shamdasani, and Touchstone (1994)	JCR	"Exploring Language Effects in Ethnic Advertising: A Sociolinguistic Perspective"	2.33	9
Mueller (1992)	JAR	"Standardization Vs. Specialization: An Examination of Westernization in Japanese Advertising"	2.22	11
Albers-Miller and Gelb (1996)	JA	"Business Advertising Appeals as a Mirror of Cultural Dimensions: A Study of Eleven Countries"	2.14	12
Zinkhan (1994)	JA	"International Advertising: A Research Agenda"	2.11	13
Taylor, Miracle, and Wilson (1997)	JA	"The Impact of Information Level on the Effectiveness of U.S. and Korean TV Commercials"	2	14
Browne (1998)	JA	"Gender Stereotypes in Advertising on Children's TV in the 1990s: A Cross-National Analysis"	1.80	15
Biswas, Olsen, and Carlet (1992)	JA	"A Comparison of Print Advertisements from the U.S. and France"	1.78	16
Roth (1995)	JA	"Effects of Global Market Conditions on Brand Image Customization and Brand Performance"	1.75	17
Caillat and Mueller (1996)	JAR	"The Influence of Culture on American and British Advertising: An Exploratory Comparison of Beer Advertising"	1.71	18
Kanso (1992)	JAR	"International Advertising Strategies: Global Commitment to Local Vision"	1.67	19
Lin (1993)	JAR	"Cultural Differences in Message Strategies: A Comparison Between American and Japanese TV Commercials"	1.67	19

Notes: SSCI = Social Science Citation Index; JCR = *Journal of Consumer Research*; JM = *Journal of Marketing*; JA = *Journal of Advertising*; JAR = *Journal of Advertising Research*.

TABLE 8
The Most Cited Researchers in International Advertising Based on Total SSCI

Author	Total SSCI citations	Rank
Jennifer L. Aaker	59	1
Dana L. Alden	49	2
George Zinkhan	48	3
J. Craig Andrews	47	4
Srinivas Durvasula	47	4
Betsy D. Gelb	44	6
Barbara Mueller	42	7
Charles R. Taylor	30	8
Cypress Chang	28	9
Fred Zandpour	28	9
Martin S. Roth	26	11
Gordon E. Miracle	24	12
Jyotika Ramaprasad	23	13
Joelle Catalano	21	14
Nancy D. Albers-Miller	19	15
John S. Hill	19	15

Notes: SSCI = Social Science Citation Index. To be ranked, a researcher had to have at least two cited publications on international advertising in the 11 selected journals between 1990 and 2002.

years covered by this study. Indeed, researchers from North America, Europe, Asia, and the Middle East have made contributions to this field of inquiry. Yet international advertising remains a relatively underresearched field. Only 122 research articles were published in the 1990–2002 period in major advertising, marketing, and international business journals, suggesting an average of less than 10 articles published per year in these journals. Moreover, because of the limited number of studies on the topic, the overall SSCI counts are relatively modest, even for the most cited articles in the area. Clearly, given the increasing importance of international advertising in the era of globalization, more and better research needs to be conducted in the future.

Second, with regard to the topical areas of research, it is evident that issues related to standardization/adaptation of international advertising continue to be a major research topic in international advertising research. Given that the standardization issue has been researched since the 1960s, it is surprising to see that there are still many scholars investigating the extent of standardization/adaptation in international advertising. Perhaps a broad integrative framework is needed to synthesize this stream of literature and advance the knowledge beyond what we have already known. Consumer response to international advertising is also a major research topic in the international advertising literature, reflecting scholars' continued curiosity about the differential responses of different cultures to various types of appeals in international advertising. Given the complexity of cultures, it can be expected that much more is needed in this area of research. Topics related to issues in campaign management and in international

advertising agencies seem to be the least researched by international advertising researchers. In an era of globalization of the advertising industry, it is surprising to find that issues related to agencies and campaigns did not attract more research attention. Difficulty in collecting data could be an explanation for the lack of research in these areas. It appears that scholars and the advertising industry need to collaborate more to facilitate knowledge development and data collection in these areas.

Third, the journals that published the largest number of international advertising research articles are *JAR*, *JA*, *IMR*, and *AIM*. Yet only four of the top-10 most cited international advertising articles, either based on cumulative SSCI citations or SSCI citations per year, came from these journals, and all four were published in *JA* or *JAR*. The other six top-cited articles were published in *JCR* and *JM*. This could be due to the broader nature of *JCR* and *JM*, which makes it more conducive for researchers to cite the articles published in these journals. It could also be the case that *JM* and *JCR* simply have greater exposure than *JA* and *JAR*. To enhance the chance of making a major impact on the literature, international advertising researchers may have to select research topics that have broad appeal, and target broad journals such as *JM* and *JCR* to publish their work. Nevertheless, *JA* and *JAR* remain popular and highly reputable outlets for international advertising research. It is worthwhile to note that *JMR* did not publish any international advertising research during the period covered by this study, and *JIBS* published only two articles. This could be due to the shifted orientation of *JMR* toward articles that use quantitative modeling in recent

years, and the tendency of *JIBS* to favor articles that use non-student participants for data collection. It may also be that *JIBS* is not at the forefront in the thoughts of international advertising scholars, in spite of its status as the top international journal. Regardless of the reason for the very small number of international advertising studies in these outlets, international advertising researchers need to make sure that their research topic and methodological approach fit the targeted journals before submitting their work for review.

Fourth, international advertising research has been conducted by researchers from a large number of institutions in North America, Europe, and Asia. In particular, based on the names of individual contributors, it appears that there are proportionally more international scholars (e.g., scholars working in other countries or foreign-born scholars working in U.S. institutions) who have made significant contributions to international advertising research. This shows that there is a wide institutional base that supports inquiries in this field. Yet the proportion of scholars who have made contributions to international advertising research and who are working outside the United States is relatively low. Perhaps the varying research traditions and unfamiliarity with publishing in English journals are the explanation for this outcome. It appears that a great potential exists for cross-national collaboration on research in international advertising. After all, collecting international data is relatively more challenging and expensive. Cross-national collaboration could conceivably ease the data-collection task and foster synergy among researchers.

Fifth, many elite research institutions do not appear to emphasize inquiries in international advertising. On the other hand, as Jennifer Aaker of Stanford University has demonstrated, scholars from elite research institutions certainly have the capacity to make a major impact on the international advertising literature. It is hoped that more scholars from elite research schools will pay more attention to international advertising research and make their contributions to advancing knowledge in this field.

Sixth, there is a core group of scholars who have made multiple and frequent contributions, either single-authored or coauthored, in the period covered by this study, and who have had a major impact on the international advertising literature based on their SSCI citations. They are the leaders of thought in the field, and their scholarship has had a significant impact on those who identify themselves as international advertising researchers. It would be very beneficial if more new scholars could join this group in the years to come, as it would be an indication of the sustained growth of the discipline as an academic field of inquiry. Finally, several articles stand out as the most influential in the international advertising literature based on the SSCI citations. Although the present study is not capable of delineating the nature of stud-

ies that cited these articles and their rationale behind the citations, these top-cited articles do reflect the core knowledge in international advertising research. Those articles with relatively high SSCI citations per year will undoubtedly continue to shape the future directions of international advertising research.

LIMITATIONS OF THE ASSESSMENT

Several limitations of this study need to be kept in mind in attempting to interpret its findings. First, the current study did not include articles published before 1990. It is not the author's intention to downplay the contributions made by scholars who published prior to 1990. Instead, the focus on the period from 1990 to 2002 was intended to keep the task manageable and to stay relevant to current international advertising researchers. Second, the current study did not include all academic journals that may publish international advertising articles. For example, the *International Journal of Advertising* was not included. Instead, only the top-ranked journals in advertising, marketing, and international business, as identified by prior studies, were included in this study. Although chances are slim that articles published in journals other than the 11 targeted in this study would have a major impact on international advertising research, it was not the intention of this study to ignore the contributions of other journals. Finally, the SSCI citation count, while popular and broad-based, does not account for citations by articles published in non-SSCI-indexed journals. Thus, the reported citation counts in this study might slightly underestimate an article's total citations in the academic literature.

REFERENCES

- Agrawal, Mandu (1995), "Review of a 40-Year Debate in International Advertising," *International Marketing Review*, 12 (1), 26-48.
- Buzzell, Robert (1968), "Can You Standardize Multinational Marketing?" *Harvard Business Review*, 49 (November/December), 102-113.
- Chandy, P. R., and Thomas G. E. Williams (1994), "The Impact of Journals and Authors on International Business Research: A Citational Analysis of *JIBS* Articles," *Journal of International Business Studies*, 25 (4), 715-728.
- Cote, Joseph A., Siew M. Leong, and John Cote (1991), "Assessing the Influence of *Journal of Consumer Research*: A Citation Analysis," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 18 (3), 402-410.
- Davis, Paul, and Gustav G. Papanek (1984), "Faculty Ratings of Major Economics Departments by Citations," *American Economic Review*, 74 (1), 225-230.
- Dubois, Frank L., and David Reeb (2000), "Ranking the International Business Journals," *Journal of International Business Studies*, 31 (4), 689-704.

- Heck, Jean Louis, and Philip Cooley (1988), "Most Frequent Contributors to the Finance Literature," *Financial Management*, 17 (Autumn), 100-108.
- Henthorne, Tony L., Michael S. LaTour, and Tina Loraas (1998), "Publication Productivity in the Three Leading U.S. Advertising Journals: 1989 Through 1996," *Journal of Advertising*, 27 (2), 53-63.
- Inkpen, Andrew C., and Paul W. Beamish (1994), "An Analysis of Twenty-Five Years of Research in the *Journal of International Business Studies*," *Journal of International Business Studies*, 25 (4), 703-713.
- Onkvisit, Sak, and John J. Shaw (1999), "Standardized International Advertising: Some Research Issues and Implications," *Journal of Advertising Research*, 39 (6), 19-24.
- Roostal, I. (1963), "Standardization of Advertising in Western Europe," *Journal of Marketing*, 27 (4), 15-20.
- Taylor, Charles R. (2002), "What Is Wrong with International Advertising Research?" *Journal of Advertising Research*, 42 (6), 48-54.
- Zinkhan, George (1994), "International Advertising: A Research Agenda," *Journal of Advertising*, 23 (1), 11-15.
- Zivney, Terry L., and William J. Bertin (1992), "Publish or Perish: What the Competition Is Really Doing," *Journal of Finance*, 47 (1), 295-329.